ARGUMENT BY ANALOGY EXERCISES

For each alternative premise, decide whether it will make the resulting argument more or less probable (1 point). Identify the criterion that justifies this judgment (1 point) and explain how that criterion applies to the given case. (2 points)

**Example**

A faithful alumnus, heartened by State’s winning its last four football games, decides to bet his money that State will **win its next game, too**.

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Suppose that since the last game, State’s outstanding quarterback was injured in practice and hospitalized for the remainder of the season.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANS.</td>
<td>Less probable; Disanalogy; The quarterback is an important player. He was present when the past games were won, but he will be absent in the next game.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Suppose that two of the last four games were played away, and that two of them were home games.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANS.</td>
<td>More probable; Variety of the instances; It doesn’t matter where the game was played, whether it be in their field or the opponent’s field, the team always won.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Suppose that, just before the game, it is announced that a member of State’s Chemistry Department has been awarded a Nobel Prize.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANS.</td>
<td>No effect; Relevance; The award of a Chemistry professor has nothing to do with how the football team performs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Suppose that State had won its last six games rather than only four.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANS.</td>
<td>More probable; Number of entities; The increase in the number of times the team won in the past makes it more likely that they’ll win again.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Suppose that each of the last four games was won by a margin of at least four touchdowns.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANS.</td>
<td>More probable; Claim the conclusion makes; The conclusion (that they’ll win the next game) is a modest or conservative one compared to the past cases when the team won by at least four touchdowns.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Although she was bored by the last few foreign films she saw, Charlene agrees to go see another one this evening, fully expecting to be bored again.

A. Suppose that Charlene also was bored by the last few Filipino movies she saw.
B. Suppose that the last few foreign films that Charlene saw were Italian, and tonight’s film is Italian as well.
C. Suppose that Charlene was so bored that she actually fell asleep while watching the foreign films.
D. Suppose that the last few foreign films she saw included an Italian, a French, an English, and a Swedish film.
E. Suppose that tonight’s film is a mystery, whereas all of those she saw before were comedies.

2. Bill has taken three history courses and found them very stimulating and valuable, so he signs up for another one, confidently expecting that it, too, would be worthwhile.

A. Suppose that his previous history courses were in ancient history, modern European history, and U.S. history.
B. Suppose that his previous courses had all been taught by the same professor who is scheduled to teach the present one.
C. Suppose that Bill found his three previous history courses to be the most exciting intellectual experiences of his life.
D. Suppose that his previous history courses had all met at 9 A.M., and that the present one is also scheduled at 9 A.M.
E. Suppose that, in addition to the three history courses he took previously, Bill had also taken and enjoyed courses in anthropology, economics, political science, and sociology.
3. An investor has purchased one hundred shares of oil stock every December for the past five years. In every case the value of the stock has appreciated by about 15 percent a year, and it has paid regular dividends of about 8 percent a year on the price at which she bought it. This December she decides to buy another hundred shares of oil stock, reasoning that she will probably receive modest earnings while watching the value of her new purchase increase over the years.

A. Suppose that she had always purchased stock in eastern oil companies before, and plans to purchase stock in an eastern oil company this year too.

B. Suppose that she had purchased oil stocks every December for the past 15 years, instead of only for 5 years.

C. Suppose that the oil stocks previously purchased had gone up by 30 percent a year, instead of only 15 percent.

D. Suppose that her previous purchases of oil stock had been in foreign companies as well as in eastern, southern, and western American oil companies.

E. Suppose she discovers that tobacco stocks have just raised their dividend payments.
ANSWERS

1. Although she was bored by the last few foreign films she saw, Charlene agrees to go see another one this evening, fully expecting to be bored again.
   A. Suppose that Charlene also was bored by the last few Filipino movies she saw.
      ANS. More probable; Variety of the instances; Even Filipino movies bore her, so this suggests that she is not into films. OR No effect; Relevance; It can be argued that how she feels about Filipino movies has no bearing on how she sees foreign films.
   B. Suppose that the last few foreign films that Charlene saw were Italian, and tonight’s film is Italian as well.
      ANS. More probable; Number of similar characteristics; The movies that bored her in the past were Italian films, and tonight’s film is of the same type. This makes the chances that she will also be bored higher.
   C. Suppose that Charlene was so bored that she actually fell asleep while watching the foreign films.
      ANS. More probable; Claim the conclusion makes; Her conclusion – that she will be bored – is modest or conservative compared to what actually happened in the past, when she was so bored she actually fell asleep.
   D. Suppose that the last few foreign films she saw included an Italian, a French, an English, and a Swedish film.
      ANS. More probable; Variety of the instances; Different types of foreign films bore her, so the suggestion seems to be that she is bored with all foreign films.
   E. Suppose that tonight’s film is a mystery, whereas all of those she saw before were comedies.
      ANS. Less probable; Disanalogy; Since the feature film tonight is of a different genre, then the chances that she will be bored with it are less.

2. Bill has taken three history courses and found them very stimulating and valuable, so he signs up for another one, confidently expecting that it, too, would be worthwhile.
   A. Suppose that his previous history courses were in ancient history, modern European history, and U.S. history.
      ANS. More probable; Variety of the instances; He took history classes with different themes or topics, so this suggests that he really enjoys history.
   B. Suppose that his previous courses had all been taught by the same professor who is scheduled to teach the present one.
      ANS. More probable; Number of similar characteristics; Some argue that the teacher is an important factor in the teaching-learning process. That the same professor will handle the class could increase the chances that he will enjoy the
class. OR No effect; Relevance; It can also be argued that the teacher has no effect or influence on a student’s enjoyment of a class.

C. Suppose that Bill found his three previous history courses to be the most exciting intellectual experiences of his life.

ANS. More probable; Claim the conclusion makes; The conclusion that he will find this new course worthwhile is more conservative than what actually happened in the past, where he found his three previous courses to be “exciting intellectual experiences.”

D. Suppose that his previous history courses had all met at 9 A.M., and that the present one is also scheduled at 9 A.M.

ANS. More probable; Number of similar characteristics; The same reasoning applied to B can apply here, too.

E. Suppose that, in addition to the three history courses he took previously, Bill had also taken and enjoyed courses in anthropology, economics, political science, and sociology.

ANS. More probable; Variety of the instances; While these may not be history courses, they are all social sciences. This could suggest that Bill enjoys the social sciences. OR No effect; Relevance; Since they are not history courses, they have no connection to the situation at hand.

3. An investor has purchased one hundred shares of oil stock every December for the past five years. In every case the value of the stock has appreciated by about 15 percent a year, and it has paid regular dividends of about 8 percent a year on the price at which she bought it. This December she decides to buy another hundred shares of oil stock, reasoning that she will probably receive modest earnings while watching the value of her new purchase increase over the years.

A. Suppose that she had always purchased stock in eastern oil companies before, and plans to purchase stock in an eastern oil company this year too.

ANS. More probable; Number of similar characteristics; She earned well with eastern oil companies, so if she purchases stock from a similar company the chances that she will earn improve.

B. Suppose that she had purchased oil stocks every December for the past 15 years, instead of only for 5 years.

ANS. More probable; Number of entities; The number of past cases have increased (from 5 to 15), so this provides her argument more support.

C. Suppose that the oil stocks previously purchased had gone up by 30 percent a year, instead of only 15 percent.
ANS. More probable; Claim the conclusion makes; Her claim that she will receive “modest earnings” is conservative considering what her stocks earned in the past (their value had gone up by 30%).

D. Suppose that her previous purchases of oil stock had been in foreign companies as well as in eastern, southern, and western American oil companies.
ANS. More probable; Variety of the instances; Despite the fact that she bought the stocks from different oil companies located in different regions, she still made money on them. So this suggests that oil stocks are really good investments.

E. Suppose she discovers that tobacco stocks have just raised their dividend payments.
ANS. No effect; Relevance; Tobacco stocks have nothing to do with oil stocks.